

NORTHERN IRELAND WOMEN'S BUDGET GROUP (NIWBG) RESPONSE TO THE CONSULTATION ON THE DEPARTMENT OF HEALTH BUDGET 2023-2024 ALLOCATIONS EQIA

Department of Health (DoH)

Prepared by Alexandra Brennan (Coordinator) of NIWBG

August 2023

The Northern Ireland Women's Budget Group (NIWBG) is made up of organisations and individuals from the women's sector, trade union movement, academia and wider civil society in Northern Ireland, with the aim of implementing a gender equal economy. The members of the NIWBG scrutinise policy and budgetary matters with a gendered lens to bring attention to the different ways in which women and men are affected by government-level decision-making. It aims to provide policy- and budget-makers with policy analysis to secure substantive equality for women and men through the assessment of gender impact.

The NIWBG works with a range of organisations in Northern Ireland on devolved issues and with sister organisations in Wales, Scotland, England and Ireland on East-West and North-South issues.

We hope that our response to the consultation will be considered by the Department of Health in regard to the Department's EQIA.

If there are any questions or comments regarding the NIWBG's consultation response, please direct them to the Coordinator for the NIWBG, Alexandra Brennan (info@niwbg.org).

Introduction

The NIWBG welcomes the opportunity to respond and provide relevant expertise in relation to the EQIA prepared by the Department. EQIAs are an opportunity to properly assess "...that all possible steps are taken to protect the most vulnerable in our society and to ensure that the impact on them is a key consideration where cuts in services are being considered." We firmly believe, as stated throughout this response, that gender budgeting is the best set of tools to help in ensuring that "the most vulnerable in our society" are protected from the Budget set by the Secretary of State and proposed departmental cuts. We also emphasise the importance of embedding equality considerations and gender analysis at all levels of the budgetary process. Ultimately, we promote the idea of a caring, green, gender-equal economy - this may seem aspirational in the face of our current budget crisis. However, we need ambitious and creative decision-making to ensure that those most marginalised in society do not face a degradation of equality, but rather a promotion of equality.

The Budgetary Process and Gender Budgeting

It is important to acknowledge that the current budget process is particularly abnormal, and we understand that the budget allocations delivered by the Secretary of State are not only highly restrictive but put undue pressure on officials to make decisions they should not have to make. The abnormality of this budget cycle also means that planning procedures that occur during a typical budget process have not taken place. Without the fulfilment of these procedures, the equality screening and impact assessment consultation comes too late in the process and is inadequate for full consideration of the impact of these spending decisions on women.

Gender budgeting requires government departments to analyse the different impact of the budget on people of different genders, starting as early in the budget cycle as possible. The aim of gender budgeting is to ensure that the distribution of resources creates more gender equal outcomes. Over time, gender analysis should become embedded at all stages of the budget process. Women's intersecting identities are also included in this analysis and policymakers are expected to promote these areas of equality as well. There is widespread political support for gender budgeting in Northern Ireland and a growing evidence base that it can help create a more equal society. In the current budget crisis women will experience particular disadvantages due to the pre-existing socio-economic conditions. For example, there is strong evidence that women have suffered disproportionately from over a decade of Westminster austerity measures, the pandemic, and the cost-of-living crisis². We cannot afford to continue making decisions at the expense of women and risk further degradations to gender equality and additional intersecting equalities as well.

¹ Equality Commission for Northern Ireland (ECNI) (2014). Budgets and Section 75: a short guide

⁽Section 75 and Budgets short quide.pdf (equalityni.org)

MacDonald, E.M. (2018) The gendered impact of austerity: Cuts are widening the poverty gap between women and men. British Politics and Policy at LSE.https://blogs.lse.ac.uk/politicsandpolicy/gendered-impacts-of-austerity-cuts/ Charlton, E. (2023) This is Why Women are Bearing the Brunt of the Cost of Living Crisis According to Research. World Economic Forum. https://www.weforum.org/agenda/2023/01/cost-of-living-crisis-women-gender-gap/

Not only is there an immediate need for gender budgeting in our current crisis, but the benefits would help to improve the budgetary process. Gender budgeting is good budgeting; it encourages greater transparency of government processes, more in-depth assessments of how policies and budgets affect constituents and closer cooperation between governmental and non-governmental stakeholders. It encourages a more targeted approach to the spending of public money, which will improve policy outcomes. Implementing gender budgeting mechanisms would provide decision-makers with the tools to recognise and mitigate gendered economic impacts and promote gender equality. Whilst political crises that affect budget processes are outside the control of departmental officials, strategically embedding gender budgeting measures will create a firewall to prevent such disproportionate disadvantages in future.

We recognise that the current equality screening and impact assessment duties under Section 75 provide policy infrastructure that could be used to progress gender budgeting. The EQIA process allows space to identify budget impacts on women and opportunities to promote more gender equal outcomes. However, too often the analysis included in these documents focuses only on equal treatment or stops at the point of acknowledging pre-existing inequalities. For gender budgeting to be fully implemented, the next stage must be to reformulate budgets and budgetary policy with targeted measures to improve outcomes for women and girls. Additionally, Section 75 screening and impact assessment typically takes places at the very end of the budget planning process or after the budget has been finalised. The OECD³ highlights that best practice for gender budgeting is to embed it at all levels of policy- and budget-making: planning, formulation, approval, implementation, monitoring and reformulation. It is crucial that gender equality obligations are not a 'tick-box exercise,' but rather that gender equality is mainstreamed in every area of the budgetary process through gender analysis of data supported by experts from civil society.

Please see Annex 1 for more on gender budgeting.

Equality Obligations

Including equality considerations in the budgets and budgetary process requires gender disaggregated data, departmental-specific and high-level equality objectives and monitoring structures. The lack of gender-disaggregated data hinders our ability to effectively advocate on behalf of women and leaves decision-makers with data that presents a false narrative – one where the diversity of experiences between women and men is unaccounted for and therefore absent in crucial policy and budgetary decisions.

We recommend that where gender-disaggregated data is available, it must be used to inform the decision-making process. Where there is no gender-disaggregated data, the Department needs to request that it is recorded. Having this information is key to completing the equality analysis required by Section 75. Without it, equality assessments do not capture the realities

³ OECD (2023), OECD Best Practices for Gender Budgeting, OECD Journal on Budgeting, vol. 23/1, https://doi.org/10.1787/9574ed6f-en.

of existing inequalities and they lack the robust evidence needed to influence policy and budgets.

This assessment is required at the earliest opportunity in the budget process and as further decisions are made in finalising the budget, not only to inform Level 5 decision-makers about their budget's effects on equality, but to ensure the budget is both clear and transparent regarding the assessment of predicted impacts. There are many opportunities in this EQIA to acknowledge where women will be disproportionately impacted by the outlined cuts. In the identified impacts on gender, it was correctly highlighted that the decision to not offer pay awards to staff would have a disproportionate impact on women as the majority of the Health and Social Care sector are women. However, other gendered impacts were not identified in the EQIA. For example, the restriction on domiciliary care packages will have a significant impact on older people and people with disabilities, but there's also a potential impact on unpaid carers which predominantly, are women. It is essential that sufficient consideration of gender inequality, paired with robust evidence, is reflected in this document to secure equality outcomes.

A Caring, Green Economy

By investing in a caring, green economy, as outlined by the Commission on a Gender-Equal Economy's report, *Creating a Caring Economy: A Call to Action*⁴, the Department could begin to tackle systemic inequalities. The Commission's report provides eight steps to securing a caring, green economy:

- 1. Re-envision what we mean by 'the economy' The pandemic demonstrated how central care, both paid and unpaid, is to our economy. We need to reassess the economic value of care to reflect its importance to the maintenance of the economy.
- 2. Invest in social and physical infrastructure It is crucial that investment social and physical infrastructure is cognizant of diverse needs, and promotes equality and sustainability.
- 3. Transform the worlds of paid and unpaid work –The NIWBG would contend that 'better jobs' does not only mean jobs in STEM, but rather fixing the aspects that make certain jobs worse, such as precarity and low-pay. This would help correct gender inequalities in the labour market and gender imbalances the sharing of paid and unpaid work.
- Invest in a caring social security system which is based on dignity and autonomy –
 This step must be addressed to alleviate pressure on paid and unpaid carers and
 mitigate an impending care crisis.
- 5. Transform the tax systems across the UK While this step lies outside the remit of devolved powers, the NIWBG would advocate for progressive tax reform at the Westminster level to produce revenue to be invested in a stronger social security system as well as in social and physical infrastructure.
- 6. Refocus the overall fiscal and monetary policy framework to build a caring economy

 The NIWBG would advocate for fiscal and monetary policy at the Westminster level
 that promotes gender equality, well-being and sustainability.

⁴ Commission on a Gender Equal Economy (2020). *Creating a caring economy: a call to action.* (https://wbg.org.uk/wpcontent/uploads/2020/10/WBG-Report-v10.pdf)

- 7. Work to develop a global trade system that is socially and environmentally sustainable The NIWBG wants to ensure that post-Brexit trade does not cause a degradation of human rights, environmental and labour standards. Ensuring that public services are excluded from trade and investment deals is also crucial to securing a caring, green economy in Northern Ireland.
- 8. Work to transform the international economic and financial system It is necessary that caring, green economies are adopted worldwide to achieve significant change regarding equality and sustainability.

The recommendations from the Commission's report are echoed in the content of the <u>Women's Policy Group's Feminist Recovery Plan</u>, which was fully updated and relaunched in July 2021. The NIWBG believes it is crucial that the content of the Commission's report and the Feminist Recovery Plan inform the Department's EQIA in relation to the Budget 2023-2024 allocations.

Conclusion

We reiterate the importance of gender budgeting tools like gender analysis and gender-disaggregated data collection in transforming the way in which decisions are made to promote gender equality, especially in the face of a budget crisis. We recommend that gender budgeting and gender analysis be incorporated into the Department's equality assessment process and that the Department builds capacity for gender and equality mainstreaming in the Budget process. We would be pleased to meet with the Department to further discuss gender budgeting as a tool to address budgetary constraints and fulfil the Department's Section 75 requirements.



BRIEF ON GENDER BUDGETING

Budgetary processes and spend are far from 'neutral' – policies emanating from the Programme for Government and budgetary decisions have gendered consequences, whether they be intended or not. By taking a 'gender neutral' stance, decision-makers are oblivious to the complexities between the experiences of women and men and reinforce systemic disadvantages faced by women and other groups.

What is Gender Budgeting?

Gender budgeting is the tool that can help recognise systemic disadvantages and lead to budgets and policies that promote greater gender equality. If implemented, policy makers would consider the gendered impacts of spending and revenue raising decisions and how to use these mechanisms to bring about gender equality. Women's intersecting identities are also included in this analysis and policy makers are expected to promote these areas of equality as well.

In <u>Gender budgeting: Working paper 1</u>, our partners Dr. Joan Ballantine, Dr. Michelle Rouse and Professor Ann Marie Gray highlight that, "Northern Ireland lags significantly behind other devolved UK administrations and other OECD countries," where gender budgeting has "made a significant contribution to addressing gender inequalities, the elimination of unequal outcomes and to increasing women's participation in civic and political life."⁵
It is important to note that gender budgeting is not about allocating more funds to women but about making sure the available resources have maximum impact. The <u>European Women's Lobby</u> breaks down the realities and misconceptions about gender budgeting as follows⁶:

Gender budgeting is about:

- Including a gender perspective into budget planning and analysing budgets taking into account their impact on women and men, girls and boys.
- Introducing a gender perspective into the entire budget, including seemingly "gender-neutral" budget lines.
- Reprioritising and refocusing of spending and restructuring of taxation with a view to promote equality.

Gender budgeting is not about:

- Creating separate budgets for women.
- Only looking at the parts of the budget which have a social content or that are explicitly gender-related.
- Demanding more spending.

⁵ Ballantine, J., Rouse, M. and Gray, A.M. (2021). *Gender Budgeting: Working Paper 1: What does the literature tell us?* Lessons for Northern Ireland (NI). (Gender, Budgeting-1, pdf)

Lessons for Northern Ireland (NI). (Gender Budgeting-1.pdf)
⁶ European Women's Lobby. What is Gender Budgeting? (What Is Gender Budgeting.pdf)

Why implement Gender Budgeting?

Gender budgeting is transformative, enhances transparency and accountability, and is of value in delivering economic benefits⁷, rights and equality⁸, and securing sustainable peace⁹.

> **Benefits of Gender Budgeting**

Good **Budgeting**

It encourages greater transparency of government processes, more in-depth assessments of how policies and budgets affect constituents and strengthened cooperation between governmental and nongovernmental stakeholders.

Economic Benefits

Besides reducing gender inequalities, gender budgeting encourages a more targeted approach to the spending of public money. **Efficient** spending of public money improves policy outcomes.

Human Rights

Gender equality is a human right and implementing gender budgeting mechanisms would provide decision-makers with the tools to recognise and mitigate gendered economic impacts and promote gender equality.

Equality

A thorough report from the Equality Commission, Equality Responsive Budgeting, outlines how gender budgeting could be incorporated into preexisting equality structures like Section 75 and EQIAs and can help meet the requirements of the equality duties.

Sustainable Peace

There is a strong correlation between gender equality and sustained peace gender equality is a better predictor of peace than GDP. To help achieve gender equality, gender budgeting mechanisms must be implemented.

⁷ Himmelweit, S. (2002). 'Making visible the hidden economy: the case for gender-impact analysis of economic policy,' Feminist Economics. 8 (1), 49-70.

Quinn, S. (2013). Equality responsive budgeting. (Equality Responsive Budgeting (equalityni.org))
 Fernanda Espinosa, M. (2020). Peace Is Synonymous With Women's Rights. (https://www.un.org/en/un-chronicle/peacesynonymous-women%E2%80%99s-rights)